

"Semantically unconvincing"

Historical semantics and etymological practice

Daniel Kölligan

Würzburg

Introduction

❖ Formal possibilities and semantic doubts, e.g. in

- γαστήρ 'belly' from γράω 'to eat'? Ved. *grásate* 'devours'. Gr. **gr̥s-e/o-*; cf. Skt. *grastar-* 'eclipser' < 'devourer'?
- Context of dissimilation probably in oblique cases: *γραστρός, γραστρί > γαστρός, γαστρί, i.e. context CRV.(C)CRV as described by Vine (2011) e.g. in φατρία next to φρατρία.
- accepted by Frisk (1960 s.v.): "Ohne Zweifel ... aus *γρασ-τήρ als "Fresser" zu γράω"
- Chantraine (1999: 212): "On admet sans hésiter l'étymologie habituelle, de *γράστηρ « dévoreur », tiré de γράω avec dissimilation des deux ρ."
- Beekes (2010: 262): "The semantics are far-fetched since the belly is not an 'eater', nor is DELG's comment convincing: 'le ventre de femme en tant qu'elle conçoit et porte un enfant'."

❖ Kroonen (2013: xiii): "Since there is no methodology for semantic reconstruction, these proto-meanings [sc. given for head-words] are not necessarily factual, and are merely to be taken as an indication of the author's intuition."

other classical problems

- ❖ ὀμείχω 'to pee', μοιχός 'adulterer' — often deemed unlikely due to different meaning, hence no good example of "Saussure-effect" (*HRo-* > *Ro-*)?
- ❖ Wackernagel (1916), Höfler (2022/23) (cf. Dieu 2023: 187—188 in CEG in REG):
 - Skt. *meh^a*- etc. also develops meaning 'have sex' without aim of producing offspring etc.; Lat. *meiō* occurs in contexts of sexual contact outside matrimony (adultery, homosexual), Skt. *meh^a*- also used for anal sex.
 - hence 'to urinate' → 'to have sex for pleasure only (without the aim of producing offspring)', cf. also Germ. **h₃moig^ho-* in **maiga-*, OE *māh* 'without shame', *gemæhð* 'desire'
- ❖ Similar relations also outside IE language, cf. for Tibeto-Burman Matisoff/Handel 2008: 299: **?-bik* 'to squirt, ejaculate' and 'to urinate'.

Roadmap

❖ Examples of recurrent semantic shifts:

- sources for words of 'fear'
- noise, crowds and compact masses
- binding diseases and cutting cures
- from gesture to speech act verb

Recurrent changes (1): fear

- ❖ metonymy: body motion / locomotion for emotion: 'tremble', 'run away', 'jump' etc. <> 'fear'
- ❖ 'shudder, tremble':
 - **b^hej₂-*, OHG *bibēn* 'to shudder' : Ved. *bháyate* 'is afraid', CLuw. *pīḥa-*, Lyc. *pige-/piḫe-* 'fear' (LIV² 72f.).
 - **kreh₁(i)-* 'to shake, sift' (Lat. *cernō*, LIV² 366–7), MWelsh *crynu* 'to shake, tremble' : *er-gryn* 'a trembling or quaking; fright, terror, horror, dread, fear' (GPC).
 - **piēh₂-*, Gk. *παίω* 'to beat' (LIV² 481–2), Lat. *pavēre*, *-eō* 'to be struck (with fear)' (cf. *pavīre*, *-iō* 'to strike'), *pavor* '(trembling with) fear' > French *peur* 'fear'.
 - **trem-*, Lat. *tremō*, Gk. *τρέμω* 'to tremble out of fear' (LIV² 648–9).
 - **tres-*, Ved. *trásati* 'trembles, is afraid', Gk. *τρέω* 'I am afraid; run away out of fear' (LIV² 650–1).

❖ 'jump':

- Gmc. **skrikkōn*- 'to jump', OHG *screckōn* 'to jump', MLG *schrecken* 'to dance', OHG *hewi-skrecko* 'grasshopper' (Germ. *Heuschrecke*) : MDu. *schricken* 'to stride; to startle', Germ. *erschrecken* 'to startle'.

❖ 'run away':

- **b^heg^u*-, Lith. *bégti*, OCS *běžati*, *běžq* 'to run' : Gk. *φέβομαι* 'to run away, flee in terror', *φόβος* 'flight; fear' (LIV² 67).
- **h₂teug-*, Hitt. *ḫatukzi* 'is terrible' : Ved. *tujoyáte* 'is startled, runs away', Gk. *ἀτύζομαι* 'run away terrified' (LIV² 286).

❖ 'step back, leave':

- PIE **tiegʰ-*, Ved. *tyaj-* 'desert, abandon', Gk. σέβομαι 'feel awe, shame, worship' : σοβέω 'to scare s.o. away' (LIV² 643: 'sich zurückziehen').

❖ 'to cower':

- **pteh₂k-*, Gk. πτώσσω 'to shrink from, flee', πτήσσω 'to cower, crouch; caus. to scare' (LIV² 495).

❖ 'to be suspended, hang':

- **kenk-*, Hitt. *kank-* 'to hang, suspend', Ved. *śaṅkate* 'is afraid', Goth. *hāhan* 'make someone be uncertain' (LIV² 325).

❖ Earlier meaning not always recoverable (if there was one):

❖ **h₂eg^h*- ‘become fearful, sad’:

- Gk. ἄχνομαι, ἄχομαι, Goth. *ōg* ‘I am afraid’, *-agjan* ‘make fear’, Ved. *aghá-* ‘sorrow, danger’ etc. (LIV² 257; cf. also Kurath 1921: 32);

❖ **d_{uei}*- ‘to startle’:

- Arm. *erknč‘im*, *erkeaw*, Gk. δείδω (LIV² 130) – if these forms are related to the numeral ‘two’ the original meaning might have been ‘be divided, “in two minds”’, similar to Germ. *Zweifel* ‘doubt’ < Gmc. **twifla-* < **d_{ui}-plo-*;

❖ **preK-* ‘to be afraid’:

- Toch. B prs. *parskam* ‘they are afraid’, A *praskatär* ‘is afraid’, Goth. *faurhts* ‘afraid’, *faurhtjan* ‘be afraid’ (**pr_oKto-*) (LIV² 491) – semantic offshoot of **prek-* ‘to ask’ » ‘to be uncertain, in doubt, fearful’?

'shame'

❖ 'shame' < 'turn away (in shame), turn one's back, turn on the heel':

- Gk. ἐντρέπομαι 'hesitate, doubt', 'be ashamed', 'feel awe, respect' → Mod. Greek ντρέπομαι 'be ashamed', ντροπή 'shame'
 - Skt. *trap-a-te* 'is ashamed', *trapā-* 'shame'
- ❖ S. OC 1541 στείχωμεν ἤδη, μηδ' ἔτ' ἐντρεπώμεθα. "But let us go now to the place [...] and let us no longer *hesitate!*"
- ❖ 2 Thess 3.14 εἰ δέ τις οὐχ ὑπακούει τῷ λόγῳ ἡμῶν διὰ τῆς ἐπιστολῆς, τοῦτον σημειοῦσθε, μὴ συναναμίγνυσθαι αὐτῷ, ἵνα ἐντραπή. "Take note of those who do not obey what we say in this letter; have nothing to do with them, so that they may be *ashamed.*"
- ❖ Alex. 71 [Kock] ἀκόλαστός ἐστι, τὴν δὲ πολιὰν οὐκ ἐντρέπεται. "He is licentious and *has no respect* for old age."
- ❖ Marc. 12.6 Ἐντραπήσονται τὸν υἱόν μου. "*They will respect* my son."

turn away in fear

- ❖ Lat. *terga vertō*, ~ *dō*, ~ *praestō*, Gr. νῶτον τρέπω, στρέφω 'turn away (+/- out of fear)'
- ❖ *tergiversor* mostly 'hesitate, try to evade, circumvent' out of fear:
 - Cic. *Pro Plancio* 48 *Quid taces? quid dissimulas? quid tergiversaris?* "Why this silence, this dissembling, this *reluctance*?"
- ❖ νωτίζω 'turn one's back':
 - E. *Andr.* 1140 οἱ δ' ὅπως πελειαῖδες
ἰέρακ' ἰδοῦσαι πρὸς φυγὴν ἐνώτισαν.
"Like doves that have seen a hawk, they turned and *fled*."

❖ Hittite *naḫḫ-* 'to fear' < 'turning away'?

- *naḫṣaratt-* 'fear'
- OIr. *nár* 'noble, modest, diffident'
- νῶτον 'back', Lat. *natis* 'rump, buttocks'.
- PIE **neh₂-* 'to turn away', implied: 'in fear' > 'to fear' (→ Hitt. *naḫ-* etc.), 'have respect awe' (→ OIr. *nár* 'having a feeling of awe, modest')
- Cf. Kölligan (2020)

Recurrent changes (2): 'noise' > 'crowd'

- ❖ metonymy 'noise' made by 'crowd, group of people': 'noise' → 'crowd'
- ❖ Ved. *krándas-*: *krand-* 'to shout, resound'
 - RV 3.26.3 *ásvo ná krándan* “like a neighing horse”
- ❖ *krándas-* ‘din of battle’; dual: two opposing armies
 - RV 10.38.1 *asmín na indra pṛtsutaú yásasvati | śímīvati krándasi práva sātáye*
“In diesem ruhmreichen Kampfe, dem heftigen *Schlachtlärm* steh uns, Indra, bei zum Gewinn, in dem Kampf um die Rinder.” (Geldner); “At this glorious battle charge, Indra, at the vehement *battle cry*, help us to win...” (Jamison/Brereton)

RV 2.12.8 *yám krándasī samyatí vihváyete páre 'vara ubháyā amítrāḥ*

“den zwei *Schlachthaufen*, wenn sie aneinander geraten, anrufen,
die beiderseitigen Feinde hüben und drüben” (Geldner);
“whom *the two war-cries*, clashing together, call upon in rivalry
—the enemies on both sides, here and over there.” (Jamison/Brereton)

RV 10.121.6 *yám krándasī ávasā tastabhāné
abhy aíkṣetām mānasā réjamāne*

“auf den die beiden *Heerhaufen*, die durch seinen Beistand eine Stütze bekamen, im Geiste bebend hinblickten”
(Geldner);
“toward whom the *two battle lines* [=heaven and earth] looked, steadied with his help, though trembling in mind”
(Jamison/Brereton)

Recurrent changes (2)

ὄμαδος ‘noise, din (of battle)’ and ‘noisy throng, mob of warriors’:

10.13 συρίγγων τ’ ἐνοπὴν ὄμαδόν τ’ ἀνθρώπων

(Agamemnon gazing towards the Trojan plain marveled at) “at the sound of flutes and pipes, and the **din** of men” (tr. Murray/Wyatt [Loeb])

Il. 7.306 ὃ μὲν μετὰ λαὸν Ἀχαιῶν

ἦϊ, ὃ δ’ ἐς Τρώων ὄμαδον κίε

“One went to the army of the Achaeans, and the other went to the **throng** of the Trojans.” (tr. Murray/Wyatt [Loeb])

- ❖ Meier-Brügger (1991): ὀπηδός ‘companion, follower’ back-formation from ὀπηδέω in turn derived from adverb *ὀπηδόν ‘in a group, among the retainers’ from abstract noun *ὀπά ‘presupposed by ὀπάων ‘follower’, Myc. *o-qa-wo-ni* (dat).
- ❖ Similarly: abstract noun *ὀμά ‘group of equals, peer group’ from ὀμός ‘one and the same, common, joint’ whence adverb *ὀμηδόν, noun *ὀμηδός
- ❖ Beside the type in -ηδον, group of adverbs in -ᾶδόν.
- ❖ Rau (2006): these forms probably go back to the adjectivization of verbal nouns in -αδ-
 - e.g., ἀμοιβάς, -άδος → ἀμοιβαδόν (Parm. 1.19) and ἀμοιβηδόν (Il.) ‘alternately’ with -η- under the influence of ἀμοιβή after the deverbal type was reinterpreted as denominal

- ❖ ὄμιλος → [ὀμιλέω, aor. ὀμιλησ- →] ὀμιληδόν.
- ❖ ἀμοιβή : ἀμοιβαδόν → ἴλη 'troop' : ἰλᾶδόν (Il.) 'in companies, in troops' and ὀμιλᾶδόν (Il.) beside ὀμιληδόν (Hes. Sc. 170)
- ❖ *ὀμά 'group of equals' via *ὀμᾶδόν 'in a group, noisy' (and maybe as intermediate form the verb ὀμαδέω 'make noise (of a group)' [Od.+]) to ὀμαδος 'noise; group',
- ❖ two largest semantic groups of adverbs in –δον: 'group' and 'noise' (cf. Rau 2006: 213—214).

- ❖ ἀγέλη 'herd' : ἀγεληδόν
- ❖ βότρυς 'cluster' : βοτρυδόν
- ❖ ἵλη 'troop' : ἱλαδόν
- ❖ ὄμιλος 'troop' : ὀμιληδόν, ὀμιλαδόν
- ❖ πύργος 'tower' : πυργηδόν 'in columns, in masses'
- ❖ φάλαγξ 'phalanx' : φαλαγγηδόν
- ❖ φυλή 'tribe' : καταφυλαδόν

- ❖ κλαγγή 'din' : κλαγγηδόν

- ❖ Germanic **suarma-*: PIE **suer-* ‘make a sound, noise’, (LIV² 613)
- ❖ Skt. *svar-a-*, e.g., RV 1.151.5 *dhenávaḥ sváranti* ‘the cows low’.
- ❖ ON *svarmr* ‘tumult’ beside OE *swearm* ‘examen, multitudo’, OHG *swarm* ‘id.’ (Germ. *Schwarm*) next to MHG *surm* [m.] ‘buzz’ < Gmc. **surma-*
- ❖ Development from ‘noise made by a crowd’ to ‘(noisy) crowd’.
- ❖ Maybe also in Gr. (Hesych.) ὕρον· σμήνος. Κρήτες ‘beehive/swarm of bees (Cretans)’, if **suoro-* parallel to ὕραξ ‘shrew, mouse’ < **suor-ak-* ‘squeaker, talker’ as argued by Vine (1999: 572–573).

'squeeze, push' → 'crowd'

- ❖ **trenk-* 'to push, shove, beat', found in Celtic, Germanic, Balto-Slavic and Iranian (cf. Av. *ṣraxta-* 'squeezed')
- ❖ 'mass, crowd' in
 - OCS *trǫtъ* 'φάλαγξ, κουστωδία', ORuss. *trutъ/ъ* 'mass' < **tronk-to-* (cf. ORuss. *trutít* 'to push')
 - Gmc. **prinh/γa-* 'to push' (Goth. *preihan*, Germ. *dringen*) with the noun **pranga-*, MHG *dranc* 'throng of people' (mostly in battle), OE *geprang*, ON *prǫng* 'crowd; wine press'
 - Lith. *treñkti* 'to beat; to buzz', *trañksmas* m. 'noise, turmoil'

- ❖ OE *crūdan* ‘to press, crush’ (cf. Kölligan & Bütthe-Scheider 2018),
- ❖ ME *press(e)* ‘crowd, throng, company’ borrowed from Fr. *presse* ‘id.’ ultimately going back to the past participle Lat. *pressus* from *premere* ‘to (com-)press’
- ❖ οὐλαμος, in Hom. 4x, always with ἀνδρῶν ‘throng of warriors’, Nic. Th. 611 μελισσαῖος ο. ‘swarm of bees’, from εἰλέω ‘to press together’ (cf. Beekes 2010: 1125).

- Applicable to other words?
- Greek ἀθρόος/ἄθρόος ‘in groups, gathered’ (Hom.+):
- *Il.* 18.497 λαοὶ δ’ εἰν ἀγορῇ ἔσαν ἀθρόοι “The people were gathered in the place of assembly.”
- ἄ- < *sm̥- ‘together’, “but the further analysis is uncertain. Risch 1937: 179 compares ἀλλό-θροος ‘speaking a foreign language’, in which case it would mean ‘calling together’(?).” (Beekes 2010: 30)
- PIE *dʰreǵ- ‘to shout’ (LIV² 155): MP *dr̥y-* ‘to shout, cry’, Greek θρέομαι, θρόος ‘sound (e.g., of an instrument, of singing), noise of many voices’ (→ θροέω)

- ❖ Pi. N. 7.81 πολύφατος θρόον ὕμνων “the famous sound of *hymns*” (Race [Loeb])
- ❖ Il. 4.433-438 describes the contrast between the Danaans marching silently into battle, while there is a noise of many voices and languages in the multiethnic Trojan army:

Τρῶες δ', ὥς τ' ὄιες πολυπάμονος ἀνδρὸς ἐν αὐλῇ
μυρίαι ἐστήκασιν ἀμελγόμεναι γάλα λευκόν,
ἄζηχες μεμακυῖαι ἀκούουσαι ὅπα ἀρνῶν,
ὥς Τρώων ἀλαλητὸς ἀνὰ στρατὸν εὐρὺν ὁρῶρει·
οὐ γὰρ πάντων ἦεν ὁμὸς θρόος οὐδ' ἴα γῆρυς,
ἀλλὰ γλῶσσ' ἐμέμικτο, πολύκλητοι δ' ἔσαν ἄνδρες.

“But for the Trojans, just as ewes past counting stand in the fold of a man of much substance to be milked of their white milk, and bleat without ceasing as they hear the voices of their lambs: so arose the clamor of the Trojans through the wide army; for they had not all **like speech** or one language, but their tongues were mixed, and they were men summoned from many lands.” (Murray/Wyatt [Loeb])

- ❖ ἴα γῆρυς and ὁμὸς (*somo-) θρόος ‘the same speech’ parallels ἄ-θρόος (*sm̥-) ‘speaking in unison, una voce’.
- ❖ *sm̥-dʰrouo- meant ‘shouting together, in unison, with one voice, united’ whence ‘in crowds, in heaps, masses, crowded together’, or, alternatively, with *sm̥- as “alpha intensivum” as in ἄβιος ‘wealthy’ (Antipho Soph. 43) ‘making a lot of noise’ > ‘crowd’.

- bridging contexts 'shouting together' <> 'in a group'?

- *Il.* 2.437–440 ἄλλ' ἄγε, κήρυκες μὲν Ἀχαιῶν χαλκοχιτώνων
λαὸν κηρύσσοντες ἀγειρόντων κατὰ νῆας,
ἡμεῖς δ' ἄθροοι ὧδε κατὰ στρατὸν εὐρὺν Ἀχαιῶν
ἴομεν, ὅφρα κε θᾶσσον ἐγείρομεν ὄξυν Ἄρηα.

“But come, let the heralds of the bronze-clad Achaeans make proclamation, and gather together the army throughout the ships, and let us go ἄθροοι (= *shouting together/in unison/in a body) through the broad camp of the Achaeans, so that we may the more quickly stir up keen Ares.” (Murray/Wyatt [Loeb])

- *Il.* 19.236 ἄλλ' ἄθροοι ὀρμηθέντες
Τρωσὶν ἐφ' ἵπποδάμοισιν ἐγείρομεν ὄξυν Ἄρηα.

“But setting out *shouting together/in one throng let us rouse sharp battle against the horse-taming Trojans.”

❖ Greek ἔθνος ‘crowd, people’

- *Il.* 13.495 ἔθνος λαῶν ‘host of men’; animals: *Il.* 2.87, 459, 469 etc. ἔθνος μελισσάων, ἔθνος ὀρνίθων, ἔθνος μυιάων ‘swarms, flocks of x’, etc.
- original /w-/? no elision in *Il.* 7.115 μετὰ ἔθνος ἐταίρων, 11.595 ἵκετο ἔθνος ἐταίρων, 17.680 κατὰ ἔθνος ἐταίρων
- Hackstein (2002: 231 fn. 75) argued that most of these instances occur after a syntactic boundary or at a caesura, where an original hiatus might be allowed.
- This is probably not the case of a syntactic unit like μετὰ ἔθνος ἐταίρων, however.
- * μed^h - ‘to beat, push’, i.e., * $\mu ed^h nos$ (n.) ‘crowded mass’

- inherited type of neuter s-stems in *-nos*,
 - Ved. *apnas-* ‘possession; work’, Lat. *mūnus* ‘service duty’, and in Greek κτήνος ‘beast’, λήνος ‘wool, fleece’, τέμενος ‘precinct’, γλήνος ‘trinket’, δήνεα ‘plans’, σμήνος ‘beehive, swarm’, ἔρνος ‘sprout’, ἔτνος ‘thick soup’, ἶχνος ‘trace’, σκήνος ‘hut, tent’, στρήνος ‘insolence’ (cf. Chantraine 1933: 420).
- Hitt. *wizzazi* and Luw. *wiwidai* ‘to strike, smash’:
 - KBo V 4 (CTH 67) Rs 29 (treaty of Muršili II with Targašnalli)
 [nu-]tta-kkan mān šakuwaššarit ZI-it UL kuwatqa wiwidāi
 “If it doesn’t press/urge you wholeheartedly. / If you do not have the wholehearted urge (to help me).”
 (repeated in Rs 36 with ú-i-wi₅-ta-[a-i], Rs 41 ú-iz-za-i; cf. Melchert 1979: 265–266)
- Differently Hackstein (2002: 231–232): ἔθνος from *ἔνθνος with a dissimilation of the two nasals which he also proposes for the notoriously difficult κεδνός < *(s)kendno- (PIE *skend- ‘shine’) and other cases with a velar nasal (ἰγνύη, φθόγγος : ἀποφθέγμα); the root would be *h₁ned^h- ‘to come’ (LIV² 249; cf. Dor. Arc. ἐνθεῖν, Ved. *adhvan-* ‘way’, ON *ḡndurr* ‘snow-shoe’)

- 
- ❖ Summary: 'crowd' ← 'make noise', 'be pushed, pressed together'
 - ❖ Kölligan (2024)

recurrent changes (3): sickness as binding

- NT: bent woman in Luke 13.11–16: healing consists in “setting straight”, raising her up,
- her former condition is explained (v. 16) as due to being bound by a demon:
 - 11 καὶ ἰδοὺ γυνὴ **πνεῦμα** ἔχουσα **ἀσθενείας** ἔτη δέκα ὀκτώ, καὶ ἦν συγκύπτουσα καὶ μὴ δυναμένη ἀνακύψαι εἰς τὸ παντελές. 12 ἰδὼν δὲ αὐτὴν ὁ Ἰησοῦς προσεφώνησεν καὶ εἶπεν αὐτῇ, Γύναι, ἀπολέλυσαι τῆς ἀσθενείας σου, 13 καὶ **ἐπέθηκεν αὐτῇ τὰς χεῖρας**· καὶ παραχρῆμα ἀνωρθώθη, καὶ ἐδόξαζεν τὸν θεόν. ... 16 ταύτην δὲ θυγατέρα Ἀβραάμ οὖσαν, ἣν **ἔδησεν** ὁ Σατανᾶς ἰδοὺ δέκα καὶ ὀκτώ ἔτη, οὐκ ἔδει **λυθῆναι ἀπὸ τοῦ δεσμοῦ** τούτου τῇ ἡμέρᾳ τοῦ σαββάτου; "11 And a woman was there who **had been crippled by a spirit** for eighteen years. She was bent over and could not straighten up at all. 12 When Jesus saw her, he called her forward and said to her, "Woman, you are set free from your infirmity." 13 Then **he put his hands on her**, and immediately she straightened up and praised God. ... 16 Then should not this woman, a daughter of Abraham, whom Satan **has kept bound** for eighteen long years, **be set free** on the Sabbath day from what bound her?"

- ‘bind’ > ‘make sick’: ἐνδέω

- Celsus (in Origenes’ *Contra Celsum*) (2nd c. CE) 8.45.15 Πόσοι δ’ αὖ πρὸς τοῖς ἱεροῖς ὑβρίσαντες αὐτίκα ἐάλωσαν, οἱ μὲν ἔκφρονες αὐτοῦ ταύτη κρατηθέντες οἱ δὲ ἐξαγγείλαντες ἃ ἔδρασαν οἱ δὲ σφᾶς αὐτοὺς διειργασμένοι οἱ δὲ νόσοις ἀνηκέστοις ἐνδεθέντες; Ἡδὴ δὲ καὶ ἐξ αὐτῶν ἀδύτων φωνὴ βαρεῖα καθεῖλέν τινας.

“And again, how many have met with summary punishment for showing want of reverence to the temples—some being instantly seized with madness, others openly confessing their crimes, others having put an end to their lives, and **others having become the victims of incurable maladies!** Yea, some have been slain by a terrible voice issuing from the inner sanctuary.”

- AVŚ 1.8.1 Against the kṣetriya-disease

- *úd agātāṃ bʰágavatī vicṛtau nāma tārake /
ví kṣetriyāsya muñcatām adʰamám pásam uttamám*

“Arise are the (two) blessed stars called the *Unfasteners* (*vicṛt*) ; let them *unfasten* (*vi-muc*) of the *kṣetriya* the lowest, the highest fetter.” (Whitney)

Sickness is binding

❖ Arm. *hiwand* ‘sick’ : Gk. ἀσθενής, ἀσθενῶν

- *hiwand ēi, ew tsek‘ zis* : ἡσθένησα καὶ ἐπεσκέψασθέ με
‘I was sick and you visited me.’ (Mt 25.36)
- *Ew darjan andrēn patgamawork‘n i town, ew gtin zcaṛayn hiwand bžškeal*:
καὶ ὑποστρέψαντες εἰς τὸν οἶκον οἱ πεμφθέντες εὗρον τὸν δοῦλον ἀσθενοῦντα ὑγιαίνοντα.
‘Then the men who had been sent returned to the house and found the sick
servant well.’ (Lk 7.10)

❖ Borrowed from MIran. **hī/ēwand*, Manichaen MPers. *xyndg* [xī/ēndag] ‘ill, sick’, Man. Parthian *hyndag* < **xī/ēwandag*.

- cf. MP *zyndk’* [zīndag] ‘alive’ < *zywndk’* [zīwandag]

Sickness is binding

- ❖ Maybe from **sh₂ei-* ‘to bind’: Hitt. *išhiia-* ‘to bind’, Ved. *sināti* ‘id.’ (Yakubovich 2009: 270f.)
- ❖ **sh₂i-*uent-** > Iran. **hīwand-*, or **sh₂ei-o-* → **sh₂ei-o-*uent-** > Iran. **haiawant-* > Parth. **hēwand-*, or **sh₂ei-*uent-** beside **sh₂ei-*uo-**, cf. Lat. *saeuus* ‘wild’ < ‘bound by madness’.
- ❖ For the meaning cf. OHG *sēr* ‘pain; sore’ (Germ. *sehr*) < Germ. **saira-* (quasi **sh₂oi-ro-*), OIr. *saeth* ‘trouble, distress’ < **seh₂i-tu-*.

recurrent changes (3): sickness as binding

- Greek νόσος: PIE **Hned^h-* 'to bind' in Vedic *náhyanti* (**Hṇd^h-je/o-*), OIr. *-naisc*, *-nascat* (**Hṇdh-ske/o-*) (LIV² 227)
- hypothesis: **Hnod^hso-* > Gr. νόσος
- Gender taken from ἀσθένεια, ἀρρωστία; originally adj. ***Hnod^hsó-*, epithet of such a noun? 'binding disease' > 'disease', or epithet of ψυχή or φύσις 'bound soul/nature' (Willi 2008:158).
- Word formation: *s*-stem **Hned^hos* 'binding, something bound' → **Hṇd^hsó-* 'having a binding' → **Hnód^hso-* 'that which has a binding' > νόσος 'binding, obstruction'?
 - cf. e.g. **plekós* n. 'Flechten' (gr. πλέκος n. 'Flechtwerk, Korbarbeit' Ar.) → **plak-s-ó-* 'Flechten habend' → **plokso-* 'Geflochtenes' (urgerm. **flahsa-* in ahd. *flahs* m. 'Flachs, Docht', ae. *fleax* n.) (cf. Höfler Diss.)

- Problem of epic νοῦσος: <οῦ> only in the simplex in Ionic
- Hp. and Hdt. have νοσέω and compounds like ἐπίνοσος:
 - Hdt. νοῦσος 33x, νοσέω 9x
 - <ο> and <ου> side by side e.g. in Hdt. 3.149 ὑστέρω μέντοι χρόνῳ καὶ συγκατοίκισε αὐτὴν ὁ στρατηγὸς Ὀτάνης ἔκ τε ὄψιος ὀνείρου καὶ **νούσου** ἥ μιν κατέλαβε **νοσήσαι** τὰ αἰδοῖα
 "Afterwards Otanes, the Persian general, gave his aid to settle the land, being moved thereto by a dream, and a sickness which attacked his secret parts."
- Hence, likely that this is somehow secondary.
- Homer only has <νοῦσος> and no other derived forms like νοσέω etc.

νοῦσος

- Chantraine *Gr. Hom.* 1.162: "Il n'est pas sûr que νοῦσος 'maladie' repose sur *νοσΦος."
- Original geminate /ss/?
 - Beekes 2010: 1024: "Since Herodotus has νοῦσος beside νοσέω (which is predominant in Ionic anyhow), it is thought that the former is a Homerism in Hdt. Mechanically, we have to reconstruct a pre-form *νόσφος on the basis of our material, but as Wackernagel 1916: 86 suggested, epic νοῦσος could also be understood as a false rewriting of ΝΟΣΟΣ, which would represent *νόσσος. The epic form must then have been taken over by Hdt. and Hp."
 - Lejeune 117: "On a vu aussi (§ 63) qu'une occlusive dentale s'assimile à une sifflante qui suit pour donner une sifflante forte, stable devant voyelle et en fin de mot, et représentée soit par -σσ-, soit par -σ-, entre deux voyelles dont la première est brève (§ 92) : hom. κομί(σ)σαι, att. κομίσαι. Seuf le béotien assimile la sifflante à l'occlusive : κομιττη."
 - If so, and if groups of alveolar + /s/ first become geminates, *nossos < *Hnod^hsos would make sense phonologically.
 - What should have triggered "false rewriting"? Geminates are not a problem per se. Avoidance of homograph (Ion.) νοσσός (m.) 'chick, young bird' (A.+ frg. 219a [Radt] [].νοσσων χ[; beside νεοσσός, Att. νεοττός)? ΝΟΣ(Σ)ΟΝ ΑΝΑ ΣΤΡΑΤΟΝ ΩΡΣΕ (ΚΑΚΗΝ ...)

- Metrical lengthening? In *Iliad* νοῦσος 3x, only verse-initially.
 - Cf. /ānera/ 4x, /āneras/ 17x beside /andra/ 84x /andras/ 44x, i.e, /ānera-/ only used with metrically lengthened /ā/.
- Or suffix variation *Hnod^hs-o-/*Hnod^hs-uo-?
 - Cf. οὖλος ‘destructive’ < *h₃olh₁uo- and the pair οὔρος ‘guardian’, Myc. wo-wo /uor-uo-/: compounds with *^ouor-o- like θυρ-ωρός ‘doorkeeper’. Cf. García Ramón (2000).
 - οὖλος < *oluo- might also provide a semantic model for *nosuo-, both can refer to divinely sent ill-being or the divinity sending it (οὖλος Ἄρης, Ἑρως, Ὀνειρος).

- Many other proposals for this word (cf. Willi 2008):
 - Brugmann (1911): **nortswō-* 'leidenschaftliche Erregtheit'
 - but root **nert-* not attested in Greek, and sound change does not fit
 - Thieme (1984): **nos-suō-* 'die Nase schüttelnd'?? (σεύω), suffix *-suō-*?
 - Meier-Brügger (1990): **nokih₂*, cf. νεκρός 'corpse', Lat. *nex* 'death' → **nokio-* > **νόσσο-* -- but expect Attic **νόττος* in this case; and νόσος does not mean 'death' or 'lethal disease'.
 - Peters (1988-90): related to νώθης, νωθρός 'sluggish', **n̥o-h₃dʰsuō-*? Expect **νώσος*.
 - Willi (2008): **n̥o-h₁osuō-* 'not having **h₁osu-*', cf. Hitt. *āššu-* 'good' -- but rather expect **an-os^o* in this case.
 - νόσος would be the only case of this development; his etymology of νόθος 'bastard' related to ὀθομαι 'to take heed'? Semantically not compelling; why **n̥o-h₃e/odʰ-* rather than **n̥o-h₃dʰ-*? Which PIE root? No comparative data available. If inner-Greek formation, rather expect ἄνοθος.
 - Kloekhorst (2008: 224) reconstructs **h₁o-h₁s-u-* (cf. ὥχύς, Ved. *āśu-* 'fast' from **h₁o-h₁k-u-*?) -- this would rule out a connection with νόσος. Elsewhere only *e-* or *ø-* grades are found, Gr. *έύς* < **h₁(e)su-*.

healing by herbs, surgery and incantation

- ❖ Maybe tripartite concept of healing in Indo-European:
- ❖ Benveniste (1945) compares Avestan *Videvdāt* 7.44 with Pindar:

Pindar, *Pyth.* 3.47–54 τοὺς μὲν ὦν, ὅσσοι μόλον αὐτοφύτων
έλκέων ξυνάονες, ἢ πολιῷ χαλκῷ μέλη τετρωμένοι
ἢ χερμάδι τηλεβόλῳ,
ἢ θερινῷ πυρὶ περθόμενοι δέμας ἢ
χειμῶνι, λύσαις ἄλλον ἀλλοίων ἀχέων
ἔξαγεν, τοὺς μὲν μαλακαῖς ἐπαιδαῖς ἀμφέπων,
τοὺς δὲ προσανέα πί-
νοντας, ἢ γυίοις περάπτων πάντοθεν
φάρμακα, τοὺς δὲ τομαῖς ἔστασεν ὀρθούς.

“Now all who came to him afflicted with natural
sores or with limbs
wounded by gray bronze or by a far-flung stone, or
with bodies wracked by
summer fever or winter chill, he relieved of their
various ills and restored
them; some he tended with calming incantations,
while others drank
soothing potions, or he applied remedies to all
parts of their bodies; still
others he raised up with surgery.”

Vd 7.44 yaṭ. pouru.baēšaza. haṇjasānte.
spitama. zaraṭuštra.
karātō.baēšazāasca.
uruuarō.baēšazāasca.
mąθrō.baēšazāasca.
təm. iθra haṇjasānte.
yaṭ. mąθram. spəntəm baēšazəm:
aēšō. zī. asti. baēšazanqm. baēšaziiōtəmō.
yaṭ. mąθram. spəntəm. baēšaziiō.
yō. narš. ašaonō. haca. uruθβqn. bišaziiāṭ.

Wenn (Ärzte) zusammenkommen, (die) verschiedene
Heilarten haben,
o Spitama Zarathustra —
einer (der) mit dem Messer heilt
und einer (der) mit Pflanzen(säften) heilt,
und einer (der durch Besprechung) mit dem heiligen
Wort heilt —
(so) sollen sie sich an den hier wenden , (der) mit dem
heiligen Wort heilt;
der ist der heiltüchtigen heiltüchtigster: (der) mit dem
heiligen Wort heilt,
der bei einem ašagläubigen Mann (auch) die Eingeweide
heilt. (tr. Wolf)

Recurrent changes

❖ surgery: τομή ‘cutting’ ~ Av. *karata-* ‘knife’

❖ plants: φάρμακα ~ Av. *urvara-*

❖ incantation: ἐπαιδὴ ~ *magra-*

- cf. in Homer: healing of Odysseus' wound, incantation effectively stops the flow of blood:
Od. 19.455 τὸν μὲν ἄρ' Αὐτολύκου παῖδες φίλοι ἀμφεπένοντο, / ὠτειλὴν δ' Ὀδυσῆος ἀμύμονος ἀντιθέοιο /
δῆσαν ἐπισταμένως, **ἐπαιδὴ** δ' αἶμα κελαινὸν / **ἔσχεθον**, αἶψα δ' ἵκοντο φίλου πρὸς δώματα πατρός.

“Then the staunch sons of Autolycus busied themselves with the carcass, and the wound of flawless, godlike Odysseus they **bound up** skillfully, and **checked** the black blood **with a charm**, and immediately returned to the house of their staunch father.”

❖ Cf. in Plato (5x): τέμνειν καὶ καίειν ‘to cut and burn’/surgery and cautery

- He was not a friend of spells and incantations...

- ?PIE $^{*}(H)\textit{ieh}_2\text{-}k\text{-}$: Ved. *yāc-* ‘to implore, ask for’, RV 9.86.41 *pītā indav índram asmábhyaṃ yācatāt* “Getrunken sollst du, Saft, für uns den Indra (um Segen, der Nachwuchs bringt, um Reichtum an vielen Rossen) *bitten*.” (Geldner)
 - ‘to invoke/implore/pray’? Gr. $^{*}ih_2\text{-}k\text{-}$ > $^{*}ik\text{-}$; why vocalization $^{*}ih_2\text{-}k\text{-}$ > $^{*}yak\text{-}$? Or root $^{*}(H)\textit{iek}/(H)\textit{iak}\text{-}$?
 - Il. 13.115 ἄλλ’ ἀκεώμεθα θᾶσσον· ἄκεσταιί τοι φρένες ἐσθλῶν. “But let us atone for the fault quickly: the hearts of good men admit of *atonement*.” – metaphorical use of ‘heal’, or vice versa earlier meaning (in derived form – Kurylowicz’ 4th law of analogy) ‘who can be implored/amenable to supplication’?
- Connection with OIr. *hícc* ‘health’, Welsh *iach* ‘healthy’ uncertain (cf. Schrijver 1995: 102-103; Matasović 2009: 171)
 - cf. OIr. *iccaid* ‘heals’ for which Matasović proposes a RED.PRS $^{*}\textit{ii-iek}\text{-}e/o\text{-}$ from which a noun $^{*}\textit{ii-iekkā}$ > OIr. *hícc* was derived.
 - In any case, a connection with PIE $^{*}\textit{iek}\text{-}$ ‘to speak’ may be more promising, cf. again OHG *jehan* and Germ. *Gicht* ‘gout’ (< ‘disease caused by incantation, Spruch’)

- ❖ hypothesis: Based on the motif of 'cutting a remedy' whence ἄκος 'remedy' (H.+), Gr. ἀκέομαι 'to heal' (H.+)
- acrostatic root noun of the type PIE **kérd/kerd-* 'heart': **h₂kés* : ***h₂kés-os/ei/i* > *τὸ ἀκῆς, ἀκέος, remodelled into τὸ ἄκος, ἄκεος
- Two possible factors for remodelling:
 - GEN.PL ἀκέων ambiguous if from ἀκῆς or an s-stem ἄκος – but does not seem to be attested.
 - Adjectives in -ης correlate with s-stem nouns in -ος, type μένος, εὖ-μενής:
 - cf. παν-ακῆς 'all-healing' (Call., Epicur., Hp. etc.), ἀνακῆς, -ές = ἀνήκεστος, Eur.21. (5th c.), δυσ-ακῆς, -ές, Hsch., εὖ-ακῆς, -ές; -έστερόν [ἐστι] Ruf.(?)ap.Orib inc.4.54. Ion. Adv. -ακέως 'by an easy process of healing' Aret.CA2.2.
 - analogy: μένος, °-μενής : °-ακῆς : x=ἄκος → ἀκέομαι, ἀκέσματα 'remedy' (Il.+) etc.
- **h₂kes-* also in ἀκέστωρ (epith. of Apollo, E. *Andr.* 900), ἀκεστήρ (S. OC 714)
- Also Myc. *a₂-ke-te-re/ja-ke-te-re* /h~jakestēre(s)/? (whence reconstruction *(H)jeh₂k-) – Or is this a variant of *a-ke-te-re* (thus Killen et al. 2024: 964) /askētēres/ (said of goldsmiths), maybe 'decorators', cf. ἀσκέω 'decorate' of unclear etymology...

- Problems with $*(H)\acute{\iota}eh_2k-$:
 - expect initial /h-/, so all forms would have to be East Ionic / epic – possible, since word is mostly found there (epic, medicine) and in tragedy
 - presence of /s/ in derivatives would have to be secondary: ἀκέσματα (Il.+), ἀκεστός (Il.+) from ἄκος
 - νήκεστος ‘not healable’ (Hesych. νήκεστον· ἀνάκεστον, ἀθεράπευτον), beside ἀνάκεστος, ἀνήκεστος, presupposes $*\eta-h_2k-$ rather than $*\eta-(H)\acute{\iota}eh_2k-$; Beekes (2010: 54) “could be analogical” – but what is the model? Rather the expected form if we start from $*\eta-h_2kes-to-$.
- Problem with $*h_2\acute{k}es-$:
 - Hp. ἀκή ‘healing’ back-formation to ἀκέω or $*h_2kes-eh_2$ (root does not show ablaut any longer) > $*akeh\bar{a}$ > ἀκή?
 - Note Ionic contraction of /e-ā/ in proper names in -eās: Δημήης (vs Δημέας elsewhere), Ἀπελλῆης (cf. Buck p. 36)

- Root usually reconstructed as **kes-* (LIV² 329):
 - Ved. *ví śāsti* ‘cuts into pieces’, Lat. *careō* ‘be cut off from, need’
 - Ved. *śāstra-* n. ‘knife’, Lat. *castrum* n. ‘army camp’, *castrāre* ‘to cut’
 - ?Gr. *κεάζω*, AOR *κεασσα-* ‘to split; to pound’, *εὐκέατος* ‘easy to split’ should be **εὐκέστος* / **εὐκέαστος*.
 - rather with LIV² 345/6 **keh₂u-/keuh₂-* (Toch. B *kowäm*, OCS *kovq*, *kovati* etc.).
 - Hom. *κείων* ‘splitting’ (hapax *Od.* 14.425) for **κεῶν* < *κεάων* (Schulze *Qu. Ep.* 434)? Or rest of **kes-je/o-*? Or nominal form **kes/u-eh₂* ‘things cut’?

- Heubeck *Živa Antika* 17, 1967, 17–21: maybe also Myc. *ke-ke-me-na* if /ke-kes-mena/ ‘divided’
 - for **(s)ker-* ‘to cut’, κείρω, expect /ke-kormeno-/ < **ke-kr-mh₁no-*
- or from **ǵ^heh₁-* ‘leave behind’ (χήρα ‘widow’, χώρα ‘land’) : **ǵ^he-ǵ^hh₁-mh₁no-* > /k^(h)e-k^he-meno-/?
 - ‘communal land’, land left from (in most cases) the damos to individuals, or land left untended by its owner, hence returning into communal possession.
- Heubeck’s argument against **ǵ^heh₁-* ‘leave behind’:
 - since Homer verb κίχηνμι, κίχάνω means ‘to reach, attain’, semantic shift is pan-Greek, unlikely to have happened in post-Mycenaean times.
 - Contra:
 - (a) poetic word anyway, so Homeric use may have informed all later uses;
 - (b) unproblematic to assume that the PTCP retained older meaning while rest of paradigm developed meaning ‘reach, attain’.

• ‘cut a cure’:

- A. Ag. 16 ὅταν δ’ αἰδεῖν ἢ μινύρεσθαι δοκῶ, / ὕπνου τόδ’ ἀντίμολπον ἐντέμνων ἄκος
“but when I decide to sing or hum, *applying this remedy* to charm away sleep” (tr. Sommerstein)
- Sommerstein: “lit. “incising”, a metaphor from the extraction of herbal remedies from plants by *making incisions* in their roots or stems; ἀντίμολπον “to charm away” (lit. “singing against”) alludes to another method of healing, the chanting of incantations.” → singing and cutting.
- E. Andr. 121 ἄκος τῶν δυσλύτων πόνων τεμεῖν
“(in the hope that I might be able) *to find a remedy* for your troubles so hard to cure” (tr. Kovacs)
- → τέμνω/ἐντέμνω ἄκος ‘to cut a remedy (out of a plant)’ < ‘to cut/make a cut (ἄκος)’
- A. Ch. 539 ἄκος τομαῖον ἐλπίσασα πημάτων “hoping for a *decisive cure* for her troubles.” – Sommerstein: “lit. ‘a cure by cutting, a surgical cure’.”

- Homer: *Il.* 9.249 wordplay with ἄχος ‘suffering’:

αὐτῷ τοι μετόπισθ’ ἄχος ἔσσεται, οὐδέ τι μῆχος / ῥεχθέντος κακοῦ ἔστ’ ἄκος εὐρεῖν

“On yourself will *sorrow* come hereafter, nor can *healing* be found for a harm once done.”

(tr. Murray/Wyatt)

- ‘purification’: *Od.* 22.481 οἶσε θέειον, γρη῏, κακῶν ἄκος, οἶσε δέ μοι πῦρ, / ὄφρα θεειώσω μέγαρον
(after killing the suitors:) “Bring sulphur, old woman, *to cleanse from pollution*, and bring me fire, that I may purge the hall.”
– Cf. Lat. *castus* ‘pure, spotless, unpolluted; chaste’.
- Vedic (cf. *EWAia*): *api-śas-* f. ‘das Aufschlitzen’ (Kath.+), but also *parīśāsa-* m. ‘Ausschnitt’ (AV; ŚB ‘eine Art Zange, mit welcher der Kessel vom Feuer gehoben wird’) → **epi/peri-* + **Hkes-* or **kes-*.

culturally specific practices: from gesture to speech act

- ❖ touch someone's knees as a gesture of begging, beseeching:
- ❖ *Od. 22.310* Λειώδης δ' Ὀδυσῆος ἐπεσσύμενος **λάβε γούνων**,
καί μιν **λίσσόμενος** ἔπεα πτερόεντα προσηύδα
"γουνούμαί σ', Ὀδυσεῦ· σὺ δέ μ' αἶδεο καί μ' ἐλέησον"
"But Leiodes rushed forward and **clasped the knees** of Odysseus,
and **made entreaty** to him, and spoke winged words:
'By your knees I beseech you, O., respect me and have pity.'"

without contact: *Od.* 6.141-149 (Odysseus and Nausikaa):

"And Odysseus pondered whether he should clasp the knees of the fair-faced maiden, and make his prayer (γούνων λίσσοιτο λαβών ἐνώπιδα κούρην), or whether, standing apart as he was, he should beseech her (λίσσοιτ') with winning words, in hope that she might show him the way to the city and give him clothes. And, as he pondered, it seemed to him better to stand apart and beseech her with winning words (λίσσεσθαι ἐπέεσσιν ἀποσταδὰ μιλίχοισι), fearing that the maiden's heart might take offense if he should lay hold of her knees (γούνα λαβόντι); so at once he made a speech both winning and crafty: "I clasp your knees [actually not: rather, 'I beseech you'], my queen—are you a goddess, or are you mortal?" ("γουνούμαί σε, ἄνασσα· θεός νύ τις, ἢ βροτός ἐσσι;")

→ Semantic bleaching 'to touch the knees in begging' → 'to beg' — Viennese *Küß die Hand* / *Beso las manos*.

- ❖ Similarly, 'to touch' > 'to beg, pray' in λίσσομαι, λιτή 'prayer, entreaty'
- ❖ Cf. λισσέσκετο γούνων; *Od.* 20.469 ἥπτετο χείρεσι γούνων ἰέμενος λίσσεσθ' etc.
→ 'touched at the knees, entreating' > 'entreated'
- ❖ Lith. *lytėti* (*lỹti/lỹta/-ėja*, *lytéjo*) 'to touch'; *liečiù*, *liēsti* 'to touch, vex'
- ❖ PIE **leǵt-* 'to touch' (LIV² 410)

kiss (the ground) → welcome, agree

- κυνέω 'to kiss', Hitt. *kwašš-*, PIE **kuas-* or **kue(n)s-*
- προσκυνέω 'to kiss the ground, make obeisance to the gods, fall down and worship' / 'prostrate oneself before a superior' → 'welcome, respect'
- POxy. 237 6.37 (2nd c. CE): ταύτην τὴν ἐπιστολὴν παρ[εν]εγκόντος τοῦ Χαιρήμονος καὶ ἀναδόντος ἐπὶ τῆς γ τ[ο]ῦ Ἐπεῖφ Ἀρποκρατίωνι βασιλικῶ γρα[μ]ματεῖ [δι]αδεχομένῳ καὶ τὰ κατὰ τὴν στρα(τηγίαν), παροῦσα αὐτὴ διὰ τοῦ ἀνδρός μου **προσεκύνησα** μὲν σοῦ τὰ γράμματα καὶ τοῖς [γ]ραφεῖσι ἐμμέν[ε]ιν ἡξίωσα, ἀπέδειξα τὲ(*) ὅτι τὰ ἀκόλουθα ἤδη τοῖς ὑπὸ Ῥούφ[ου] πρότερον γραφεῖσι ἐπράχθη.
"On the receipt of this letter, Chaeremon brought it on Epeiph 3 before Harpocraton, royal scribe and deputy-strategus; and I appeared in court through my husband, and not only **welcomed** your orders and desired to abide by them, but showed that a decision in accordance with the previous instructions of Rufus had already been reached." (<http://papyri.info/ddbdp/p.oxy;2;237>)

nod → grant, permit → confess, declare

Gr. νεύω/ἐπινεύω 'permit, grant' / ἀνανεύω 'deny': tr. use 'to nod something = to grant something':

- *h.Cer.* 445 νεῦσε δέ οἱ κόρυην ...
"And **he gave his approval** that her daughter, in the course of the year, should go for a third of it down to the misty dark, spending the other two thirds with her mother and the other immortals."
- *Il.* 16.250 ἕτερον μὲν ἔδωκε πατήρ, ἕτερον δ' ἀνένευσε
"One desire the father granted him, but the other he **refused**."

Lat. *adnuo* 'agree; permit, grant' / *abnuo* 'deny':

- Cic. *De or.* 2.285 *id quoque toto capite adnuit* "He nodded emphatic assent."
- Luc. *Rer. nat.* 640 *at quod scinditur et partis discedit in ullas, / scilicet aeternam sibi naturam abnuit esse*
"But that which is cleft and divided into parts assuredly **renounces** all claim to be everlasting."
- 'indicate by the hand': Act. 12.17 κατασείσας δὲ αὐτοῖς τῇ χειρὶ σιγᾶν : *aduens eis manu, ut tacerent*
- 'confess, declare': Tac. *A.* 14.60 *vi tormentorum victis quibusdam, ut falsa adnuerent* "a few were forced by their agony [questioning under torture] into making groundless admissions"

- 
- ❖ Theoretical / more general approaches like Traugott/Dasher 2002 for certain semantic domains: e.g. what do we see and what do we expect in the domain of modal verbs?
 - ❖ Data collections to see recurrent trends in semantic shifts: large models / datasets may not be able to capture individual philological details.
 - ❖ Hence, philological study of the use of each form to avoid overgeneralization.

How much machinery?

Perrone et al. 2021: 300: case study on Gr. παράδεισος:

"The diachronic evolution of sense distributions in the plots shows that the Biblical meaning comes to rise around the third century BCE in religious texts, which corresponds precisely to the beginning of the translation of the Bible in Greek, and will prevail throughout the Christian era. The graph displaying the computed distribution of senses in non-religious genres captures well the fact that between the first century BCE and the second century CE *paradeisos* is attested a number of times in the works of historians and geographers represented in the corpus. After the third century, this word is very rarely attested in the works included in the Diorisis corpus and almost half of its occurrences in non-religious texts refer to the Biblical garden of Eden."

What is the additional knowledge or insight we gain from this?

<https://www.degruyter.com/document/doi/10.1515/9783110213881.2.1091/html?srsltid=AfmBOorCX6aRDy0Xyem71C8RHjptiW0vbWsch0rQIJ5a-eL5q2AaX6vT>

Language contact?

- σπλάγχνον/-α 'innards, intestines' → 'seat of emotion, 'heart', anger', since LXX also 'compassion, pity'
 - Pr. 12.10 δίκαιος οἰκτίζει ψυχὰς κτηνῶν αὐτοῦ, τὰ δὲ **σπλάγχνα** τῶν ἀσεβῶν ἀνελεήμονα "A just person takes pity on the lives of his cattle, but the **feelings** of the impious are without mercy." (NETS)
 - Wi. 10.5 αὕτη καὶ ἐν ὁμονοίᾳ πονηρίας ἐθνῶν συγχυθέντων ἔγνω τὸν δίκαιον καὶ ἐτήρησεν αὐτὸν ἄμεμπτον θεῷ καὶ ἐπὶ τέκνου **σπλάγχνοις** ἰσχυρὸν ἐφύλαξεν. "She also, when nations, collaborating together in wickedness, were put to confusion, recognized the righteous man and preserved him blameless with God and kept him strong in the face of **compassion** for his child."
 - Mt. 9.36 Ἰδὼν δὲ τοὺς ὄχλους **ἐσπλαγχνίσθη** περὶ αὐτῶν : *Videns autem turbas **misertus est** eis*
- probably a calque of Semitic polysemy 'womb; pity': Akkad. *rēmu* 'womb; pity', Hebr. *rāhām* 'womb' — *rḥm* 'to love, take pity on s.o.' etc.
- Mod. Gr. ευσπλαγχνίζομαι 'to feel pity' ("αισθάνομαι λύπη για τη δυστυχία κάποιου") beside σπλάχνο/σπλάγχνο 'intestines'.
- → maybe not two examples of the same semantic shift

Back to the bellies

- ❖ *Od.* 17.228 βόσκειν ἦν γαστέρ' 'to feed one's belly' — so is the belly an 'eater' after all?
- ❖ No further evidence for shift as such 'eat' > 'belly'.
- ❖ Rather metonymy: 'eater' = 'mouth' → 'stomach'?
- ❖ Cf. στόμα 'mouth' and στόμαχος 'throat' (*Il.*+), later 'upper orifice of the stomach' (*Plu.*, *Gal.*), and 'stomach' (1 *Ep. Ti.* 5.23);
 - cf. loanword in Lat. *stomachus* 'oesophagus' and 'stomach'.
- ❖ → subsequent metonymies 'eater'/'mouth' → 'throat' → 'stomach'.
- ❖ 'eater'/'mouth': Germ. *Fresse* (16th c.+) 'mouth' from *fressen* 'to eat (in an uncultivated manner; also said of animals)'
- ❖ 'mouth'/'throat': Gr. χάνος 'chasm, opening', also 'gaping mouth', χάσμα θηρός *E. HF* 363, and χάσμα φάρυγος, of a lion, *AP* 6.218.

- ❖ Maybe also the meaning 'cavity' played a role, cf. Lat. *ōs* 'mouth' : Lith. *úoksas* 'opening, cavity' and words for 'belly' deriving from 'cavity' like Gr. *κοιλία* 'belly' from *κοῖλος* 'hollow', Lat. *alvus* 'belly, cavity'
 - cf. <https://clics.clld.org/edges/674-1346> for colexification of 'mouth' and 'throat'.
- ❖ Datsemshift.ru lists 40 cases for shift from 'mouth' to 'opening, hole'.
- ❖ Burmese *hnut* 'mouth' and 'womb' at the same time. Matisoff 2008: 175. The basic meaning of **s-nut/s-not* was probably 'vessel', so this is a different case than 'mouth' > 'belly, womb'.

Summary

- ❖ Certain metonymies, (conceptual) metaphors etc. re-occur time and again
- ❖ based on
 - similar physical properties of human environment across the globe
 - similar restrictions: emotions not directly observable, only their physical (gestural, facial, bodily) effects
 - recurrent experience, e.g. the more people the more noise
 - shared cultural inheritance, e.g. healing by incantation, cutting and herbs; disease is being bound by a demon; touching someone's knees is asking for mercy etc.
- ❖ inductive reasoning, alternatives are always possible, but probably better to have many similar cases than *unus testis*.



Thank you for your attention!

References



- 
- ❖ Bechmann, Sascha. 2016. Sprachwandel - Bedeutungswandel: eine Einführung. Stuttgart: UTB GmbH.
 - ❖ Benveniste, Émile. 1945. „La doctrine médicale des Indo-Européens“. *Revue de l'histoire des religions* 130: 5–12.
 - ❖ Byrd, Andrew Miles. 2016. "The rules of reconstruction - Making our etymologies more grounded", in: *Etymology and the European Lexicon. Proceedings of the 14th Fachtagung der Indogermanischen Gesellschaft, 17–22 September 2012, Copenhagen*. Edited by Bjarne Simmelkjær Sandgaard Hansen, Benedicte Nielsen Whitehead, Thomas Olander and Birgit Anette Olsen. Wiesbaden: Reichert, 81–91.
 - ❖ Chantraine, Pierre. 1933. *La formation des noms en grec ancien*. Klincksieck.
 - ❖ García Ramón, José Luis. 2000. „Homerisch οὔρος ‚Fahrtwind‘, θοῦρος ‚ungestüm‘, οὖλος ‚verderblich‘: zur Funktion der -o-stufigen *-uó-Bildungen im Griechischen“. In *Anusantatyai: Festschrift für Johanna Narten zum 70. Geburtstag*, herausgegeben von Almut Hintze und Eva Tichy. Röll.

- 
- ❖ Hackstein, Olav. 2002. *Die Sprachform der homerischen Epen: Faktoren morphologischer Variabilität in literarischen Frühformen: Tradition, Sprachwandel, sprachliche Anachronismen*. Serta Graeca ; Bd. 15. Reichert.
 - ❖ Heide, Eldar. 2014. „The Semantic Side of Etymology: Comparative Reconstruction Confined to Elements with Specific Internal Connections“. In *New Focus on Retrospective Methods. Resuming Methodological Discussions: Case Studies from Northern Europe*, herausgegeben von Eldar Heide und Karen Bek-Pedersen, 59–75. Helsinki: Suomalainen Tiedekatemia.
https://www.academia.edu/10588467/The_semantic_side_of_Etymology_Comparative_reconstruction_confined_to_elements_with_specific_internal_connections.

- 
- ❖ Höfler, Stefan. 2022/2023. "Ein urindogermanischer Seitensprung. Griechisch μοιχός 'Ehebrecher' und urgermanisch *maigaz 'schamlos'. *Die Sprache* 55, 22-26.
 - ❖ Juvonen, Päivi & Maria Koptjevskaja-Tamm. 2016. *The Lexical Typology of Semantic Shifts* (Cognitive Linguistics Research 58). Berlin: Walter de Gruyter.
 - ❖ Killen, John, ed. 2024. *The New Documents in Mycenaean Greek*. Cambridge University Press. <https://doi.org/10.1017/9781139029049>.
 - ❖ Kölligan, Daniel, und Eva Büthe-Scheider. 2018. „Germanisch *kreuḡa- und Verwandtes“. *IF* 123: 1–26.
 - ❖ Kölligan, Daniel. 2024. "Noisy crowds (and compact masses).", in: Dieu, Eric / Kölligan, Daniel. (Hrsgg.). 2024. *Homonymie, Polysemie und Etymologie in den indogermanischen Sprachen*. Dettelbach: Röhl, 155-172.

- 
- ❖ Kroonen, Guus. 2013. *Etymological dictionary of Proto-Germanic*. Leiden: Brill.
 - ❖ Matisoff, James A. 2008. The Tibeto-Burman reproductive system: toward an etymological thesaurus. University of California Press. <<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/3c40r8jv>>
 - ❖ Meier-Brügger, Michael. 1991. „Zu griechisch ὀπηδός“. *Glotta* 69(3-4): 171–72.
 - ❖ Perrone, Valerio, Simon Hengchen, Marco Palma, Alessandro Vatri, Jim Q. Smith, and Barbara McGillivray. 2021. ‘Lexical Semantic Change for Ancient Greek and Latin: Computational Approaches to Semantic Change’. In *Computational Approaches to Semantic Change (Volume 6)*. Language Science Press.
 - ❖ Probert, Philomen, Rodda, Martina Astrid, McGillivray, Barbara. 2019. Vector space models of Ancient Greek word meaning, and a case study on Homer. *TAL* 60(3), 63-87.

- 
- ❖ Rau, Jeremy. 2006. „The Greek Adverbs in -δην -δον -δα“. *Glotta* 82: 211–20. JSTOR.
 - ❖ Tahmasebi, Nina, Lars Borin, Adam Jatowt, Yang Xu, and Simon Hengchen, eds. 2021. *Computational Approaches to Semantic Change*. Berlin: Language Science Press.
 - ❖ Schrijver, Peter. 1995. *Studies in British Celtic Historical Phonology*. Leiden studies in Indo-European 5, Typ: Text. Rodopi.
 - ❖ Traugott, Elizabeth Closs, and Richard B. Dasher. 2002. *Regularity in Semantic Change*. Cambridge University Press.
 - ❖ Vine, Brent. 1999. „On ‚Cowgill’s Law‘ in Greek“. In *Compositiones indogermanicae in memoriam Jochem Schindler*, herausgegeben von Heiner Eichner und C. Luschützky. Enigma Corp.

- 
- ❖ Vine, Brent. 2011. „On dissimilatory r-loss in Greek“. In *_Indogermanistik und Linguistik im Dialog: Akten der XIII. Fachtagung der Indogermanischen Gesellschaft vom 21. bis 27. September 2008 in Salzburg_*, herausgegeben von Thomas Krisch und Thomas Lindner. Reichert.
 - ❖ Wackernagel, Jacob. 1916. *Sprachliche Untersuchungen zu Homer. Forschungen zur griechischen und lateinischen Grammatik* 4. Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht.
 - ❖ Willi, Andreas. 2008. νόσος AND όσίη: ETYMOLOGICAL AND SOCIOCULTURAL OBSERVATIONS ON THE CONCEPTS OF DISEASE AND DIVINE (DIS)FAVOUR IN ANCIENT GREECE. *Journal of Hellenic Studies* 128, 153-171.
 - ❖ Yakubovich, Ilya. 2009. „Two Armenian Etymologies“. In *Giorgi Melikishvili Memorial Volume*, ed. Irene Tatišvili, Manana Hvedelidze, Levan Gordeziani. Ivane Javakhishvili Institute of History and Ethnology. 266-272.